

Contents

Agenda	2
4 - Minutes of the previous meeting	6
5 - Food Standards Agency Focused Audit of Gwynedd Council's Arrangements for Enforcement of Food Safety	10
6 - Update on Bus Services in Arfon Area	19
7 - The Committee's Forward Work Programme (draft) 2014-15	24



Gwasanaeth Democraidd
Democratic Service
Swyddfa'r Cyngor
CAERNARFON
Gwynedd
LL55 1SH

Cyfarfod / Meeting

PWYLLGOR CRAFFU CYMUNEDAU
COMMUNITIES SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

Dyddiad ac Amser / Date and Time

10:30am, DYDD GWENER, GORFFENNAF 4ydd, 2014

10.30am, FRIDAY, 4th JULY, 2014

Lleoliad / Location

SIAMBR HYWEL DDA
SWYDDFEYDD Y CYNGOR / COUNCIL OFFICES
CAERNARFON

Pwynt Cyswllt / Contact Point

Lowri Haf Evans (01286 679 878)

lowrihafevans@gwynedd.gov.uk

Dosbarthwyd / Distributed 26-06-2014

Aelodaeth/Membership (18)

Plaid Cymru (9)

Y Cynghorwyr/Councillors

Craig ap Iago	Annwen Hughes	Gethin Glyn Williams
Dilwyn Morgan	Linda Morgan	Tudor Owen
Caerwyn Roberts	Mandy Williams-Davies	Eurig Wyn

Annibynnol/Independent (4)

Y Cynghorwyr / Councillors

Eric M. Jones	Nigel Pickavance	Angela Russell	Mike Stevens
---------------	------------------	----------------	--------------

Llais Gwynedd (3)

Y Cynghorwyr/Councillors

sedd wag	Gruffydd Williams	Robert J. Wright
----------	-------------------	------------------

Llafur/Labour (1)

Y Cynghorydd/Councillor

Gwynfor Edwards

Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol / Liberal Democrats (1)

Y Cynghorydd/Councillor

Stephen Churchman

Aelodau Ex-officio / Ex-officio Members

Cadeirydd ac Is-Gadeirydd y Cyngor
Chairman and Vice-Chairman of the Council

RHAGLEN

1. CROESO AC YMDDIHEURIADAU

Derbyn unrhyw ymddiheuriadau am absenoldeb.

2. DATGAN BUDDIANT PERSONOL

Derbyn unrhyw ddatganiad o fuddiant personol.

3. MATERION BRYS

Nodi unrhyw eitemau sy'n fater brys ym marn y Cadeirydd fel y gellir eu hystyried.

4. COFNODION

Bydd y Cadeirydd yn cynnig y dylid arwyddo cofnodion y cyfarfod diwethaf o'r Pwyllgor hwn, a gynhaliwyd ar 13 Mai, 2014, fel rhai cywir

(copi yma – papur **melyn**)

5. ARCHWILIAD MANWL YR ASiantAETH SAFONAU BWYD AR DREFNIADAU CYNGOR GWYNEDD AR GYFER GORFODI DEDDF DIOGELWCH BWYD 1990: 6 A 7 MAWRTH 2014.

Ystyried adroddiad Pennaeth Rheoleiddio

(copi yma – papur **pinc**)

6. DIWEDDARIAD GWASANAETHAU BWS YN ARDAL ARFON

Ystyried adroddiad yr Aelod Cabinet

(copi yma – papur **gwyrdd**)

7. BLAEN RAGLEN WAITH DRAFFT CRAFFU 2014 – 2015

Cyflwyno'r fersiwn ddiweddaraf o'r rhaglen waith

(copi yma – papur **glas**)

AGENDA

1. WELCOME AND APOLOGIES

To accept any apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATION OF PERSONAL INTEREST

To receive any declaration of personal interest.

3. URGENT ITEMS

To note any items that are a matter of urgency in the view of the Chairman for consideration.

4. MINUTES

The Chairman shall propose that the minutes of the last meeting of this committee, held on 13 May, 2014, be signed as a true record.

(copy herewith – **yellow** paper)

5. FOOD STANDARDS AGENCY FOCUSED AUDIT OF GWYNEDD COUNCIL'S ARRANGEMENTS FOR ENFORCEMENT OF THE FOOD SAFETY ACT 1990: 6TH AND 7TH MARCH 2014.

Consider the Head of Regulatory Departments report

(copy herewith – **pink** paper).

6. UPDATE ON BUS SERVICES IN ARFON AREA

Consider the Cabinet Members report

(copy herewith – **green** paper)

7. THE COMMITTEE'S FORWARD WORK PROGRAMME (DRAFFT)

Submit a revised edition of the Committee's Forward Work Programme

(copy herewith – **blue** paper)

COMMUNITIES SCRUTINY COMMITTEE 13.05.14

PRESENT - Councillor Eric M. Jones, (Chair)
Councillor Angela Russell (Vice-chair).

Councillors:- Stephen Churchman, Annwen Hughes, Louise Hughes, Dilwyn Morgan, Linda Morgan, Tudor Owen, Nigel Pickavance, Mike Stevens, Gethin Glyn Williams, Gruffydd Williams, Mandy Williams-Davies, Robert J. Wright and Eurig Wyn.

OFFICERS: Debbie Anne Williams Jones (Democratic Services Manager), Lowri Haf Evans (Member Support and Scrutiny Officer).

ALSO PRESENT:

- i) In relation to item 5 on the agenda – Councillor W. Gareth Roberts – Cabinet Member for the Environment, Gwyn Morris Jones (Head of Highways and Municipal Department), Sion Gwynfryn Williams (Communications Manager), Janet Roberts (Senior Manager – Change Delivery and Support Service) and Arwel Ellis Jones (Senior Manager- Corporate Commissioning Service).
- ii) In relation to items 7 and 8 on the agenda – Councillor John Wyn Williams – Cabinet Member for Planning, Aled Davies (Head of Regulatory Department), Rhun ap Gareth (Senior Solicitor).

1. ELECTION OF CHAIR

In accordance with the Local Government Measure (Wales) 2011, it was a requirement to share the chairpersonships of Scrutiny Committees on the basis of political balance and in accordance with the Council's decision, it was agreed that the chairpersonship of this Committee should go to the Independent Group to reflect the custom for the vice-chair to naturally take over the chair.

RESOLVED: to elect Councillor Angela Russell as Chair of this Scrutiny Committee for 2014/15.

2. ELECTION OF VICE-CHAIR

Following the recommendation of the Business Group to leaders of the main political groups, the vice-chairpersonship of the Communities Scrutiny Committee would go to Plaid Cymru.

RESOLVED: to elect Councillor Mandy Williams-Davies as Vice-chair of this committee for 2014/15.

Councillor Eric Merfyn Jones took the opportunity to thank everyone for their support during his period as Chair.

3. WELCOME AND APOLOGIES:

The Chair welcomed everyone to the meeting. Apologies were received from Councillors Craig ap Iago and Caerwyn Roberts.

4. DECLARATION OF PERSONAL INTEREST

No declarations of personal interest were received.

5. URGENT ITEMS

The Chair/Vice-chair agreed, under Section 100B (4) (b) Local Government Act 1972 to scrutinise the decision of the Cabinet to collect residual waste every three weeks as an urgent item because it would be too late to scrutinise the item at the next meeting of the Scrutiny Committee as the decision of the Cabinet would be implemented by then and the matter was important for residents of the County.

THE WASTE STRATEGY - CHANGE TO RESIDUAL WASTE COLLECTION

- a) Submitted – the report which had been submitted to the Cabinet on 29.4.2014 by the Cabinet Member for the Environment and the Head of Highways and Municipal Department noting their intention change the procedure for collecting residual waste of Gwynedd residents to a collection frequency of three weeks.
- b) The logic for the change was clearly noted and it was emphasised that it was timely to consider options for the use of residual bins as any waste placed in the green wheelie bins went directly into landfill.
- c) If the Waste Strategy was to be achieved, the statutory targets in terms of landfill allowances realised, along with the recycling levels and to avoid substantial fines for the Council – a change had to be introduced to the current system of collecting residual waste from domestic property in Gwynedd.
- Ch) After a successful engagement exercise period, it was highlighted that the main risks and concerns had been addressed in the Final Business Case.
- d) During the discussion, the following observations were made:-
 - i. Gwynedd was not ready for the change.
 - ii. People would have to be educated by concentrating on those who did not recycle.
 - iii. An intensive marketing plan would have to be considered with a clear communication plan.
 - iv. A clear and readable statement would have to be submitted to the press explaining the situation – beneficial to the image of Gwynedd.
 - v. The decision should have been made by the Full Council and not the Cabinet.
 - vi. There was support for the proposal but there was a need to hold a further discussion/investigation before launching the plan in Dwyfor in October 2014.
- dd) It was proposed, seconded and voted upon that the Committee should scrutinise the response of Dwyfor to the changes. The starting date for introducing the change in Dwyfor would be 6 October, 2014. There would be a fixed break prior to introducing the plan in Meirionnydd (7 March, 2015).

RESOLVED: THAT THE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE WILL SCRUTINISE THE EFFECT OF THE CHANGES ON THE RESIDENTS OF DWYFOR DURING THE 4TH QUARTER OF 2014/15.

6. MINUTES

The minutes of the previous meeting of this committee held on 4 March, 2014 were accepted as a true record, subject to noting that Councillor Stephen Churchman was

present at the meeting.

7. THE EFFECT OF SECTION 106 AGREEMENTS ON THE VIABILITY OF COMMUNITIES

- a) Submitted – the report of the Head of Regulatory Department responding to the questions identified during discussions at the preparatory meeting of the Scrutiny Committee (8.4.14).
- b) Reference was made to the research work of the Strategic Housing Unit that was trying to discover whether there were obstacles with 106 agreements (report distributed).
- c) The Cabinet Member provided a response to a request for information in relation to arrangements available to facilitate local people to remain in their communities along with the likely impact of proposed changes to the Planning System in Wales on providing affordable homes and implementing 106 agreements in the future.
The Cabinet Member stated that:-

- i. Some mortgage companies/lenders now considered assisting and this change was to be welcomed.
- ii. Gwynedd Council had considered a scheme to support self-build but were criticised by the Government of 'unfair competition'. The Council was still trying to resolve the situation.
- iii. A 106 agreement could be considered as an 'additional tool' in a planning process to promote affordable housing.
- iv. It would be possible to consider the option of not having 'affordable housing' but rather to develop more social housing for renting but if this was a path which could be followed, then communities had to be ready to accept it.
- v. A 106 condition was not a perfect system but it was a system that encouraged and promoted the aspirations of residents to remain in their locality.

ch) During the discussion, the following observations were made:-

- i. Had the Council considered a Permanent Housing Condition?
Response: Yes, but there was a need for a robust policy context to make this effective. Council Solicitors were gathering evidence to justify the need in order to establish the context.
- ii. Empty Units – how do we get them back into use?
Response: Very enthusiastic Empty Homes Officers prioritise where there is need. Approximately 55 houses brought back into use annually. Resources were scarce.
- iii. Need to ensure that the Planning Bill gave consideration to local culture.
Response: The Cabinet Member and the Head of Regulatory Department had attended the Government's Scrutiny Committee to respond to the Planning Bill. Gwynedd Council had responded robustly to issues involving the Welsh language and local culture when discussing the Bill.
- iv. A request from Councillor Gethin Williams for the number of 106 schemes that had been received.
Response: The Head of Regulatory Department would share the statistics with the Councillor.

RESOLVED: TO ACCEPT THE REPORT.

8. CONTROL OF CARAVANS PARKING ON GWYNEDD COUNCIL, SNOWDONIA NATIONAL PARK AND NATURAL RESOURCES WALES PROPERTY OR IN A LAY-BY WITHOUT PERMISSION

- a) Submitted – a verbal report by the Head of Regulatory Department, highlighting that the above cases were discussed across departments in the Council and whoever dealt with an individual case depended on the ownership or control of the site. It was stated that the usual procedure was to respond to each case individually and to share information with other relevant departments. The most likely action would be to encourage the vehicles to move on. Usually the Police would be part of the discussion. There were no by-laws in Gwynedd generally to deal with this issue and it was very difficult to deal with some of the welfare rights issues that could arise.
- b) When considering specific cases that Councillors had in their wards, it was proposed that local discussions should be encouraged and held with officers and Council solicitors to resolve the ownership of the site.
- c) During the discussion, the following observations were made:-
 - i) The need to resolve the situation If vehicles were encouraged to move on it had to be ensured that they did not move on for example to the next lay-by.
 - ii) It was suggested that there should be more signs.
 - iii) There was a need to keep a balance – there was no need to ‘drive’ visitors from Gwynedd.

The information was accepted. The Head of Regulatory Department was willing for the Department to facilitate local discussions.

9. SCRUTINY FORWARD WORK PROGRAMME 2013-14

- a) The most recent version was submitted for information.

Everyone was thanked for their contribution.

The meeting commenced at 10.30am and concluded at 1.15pm.

NAME OF SCRUTINY COMMITTEE	COMMUNITIES
DATE OF MEETING	4 July 2014
TITLE	Food Standards Agency Focused Audit of Gwynedd Council's arrangements for enforcement of the Food Safety Act 1990: 6th and 7th March 2014.
AUTHOR	Aled Davies, Head of Regulatory Department
CABINET MEMBER	Cllr W. Gareth Roberts
PURPOSE	

Background

1. The Food Standards Agency carried out a Focused Audit of Gwynedd Council's arrangements for enforcement of the Food Safety Act 1990 on 6th and 7th March 2014.
2. The Audit focused on the following topics:
 1. The implementation of the Recommendations of the Public Inquiry into the September 2005 Outbreak of E. coli O157 in South Wales, and
 2. The Management of Interventions at New Food Businesses.
3. The Audit was prompted by a recommendation in the Report of Professor Pennington (March 2009) that a substantial review of food hygiene enforcement in Wales should take place approximately five years after the publication of his report and the FSA Wales have been requested by Welsh Government to submit a report by the end of April with an assessment of the current situation in Wales.
4. The findings of the Audit reflect badly upon Gwynedd. The Audit report itself will be published and the findings will be included in the report to the Welsh Government Minister for Health and Social Services. The report will single out Gwynedd as being alone in not having effectively implemented the Pennington Recommendations and it is essential that Gwynedd Council develops an effective strategy for addressing these failings.

The Audit Report

5. The Council has received a report giving the findings of the Audit. The Council was invited to consider the findings and report any factual inaccuracies but the Food Standards Authority gave notice that it expected the Council to develop an Action Plan to address the issues identified for improvement by 12th May 2014.
6. Although there have been some queries raised by staff regarding the content of the report, these relate to the manner in which the findings have been stated and to disagreements with regard to the interpretation of subjective matters rather than factual inaccuracies.
7. The findings of the Audit may therefore be taken as a fair representation of the actual topics examined. As such, the report does not make comfortable reading for Gwynedd Council as a number of serious non-compliances were found. These findings are of concern in themselves but, given that the audit only focused on two topics and was very brief in duration, they do inevitably raise questions regarding other aspects of the Food Safety provision by Gwynedd Council.
8. The report is clearly set out as the two topics are dealt with in separate Annexes. In Annex 1, which deals with the implementation of the Recommendations of the Public Inquiry into the September 2005 Outbreak of E. coli O157 in South Wales, the findings are divided into three sections, namely where:
 - a) recommendations which had been fully implemented the Authority
 - b) recommendations where the Authority had demonstrated overall compliance but where cases had been identified where these recommendations had not been implemented:
 - c) recommendations where compliance with implementation was found to be poor:
9. While there were a number of recommendations which had been fully implemented the Authority, there were considerably outnumbered by those which had not. To summarise the non compliances found
 - *The audit had discovered cases where action had not been escalated to deal with non-compliant food establishments.*
 - *Evidence was not available that all officers responsible for inspecting food businesses had received necessary accredited/certified training.*

- *A number of inconsistencies in the application of scores relating to confidence in a business's management of food safety were identified.*
- *Insufficient information was available in the food establishments files checked to demonstrate that adequate consideration of cross contamination risks had been consistently carried out during inspections.*
- *In a significant number of cases, insufficient information relating to food businesses' critical control points had been captured.*
- *The Authority's documented inspection procedure (last revised in Nov 08) did not include the requirement for matters of concern to be highlighted for the benefit of the officer carrying out the next planned inspection. File checks demonstrated that concerns/potential problems were not being consistently highlighted and followed up at the next inspection.*
- *Generally, the authority was unable to demonstrate that discussions with employees were being carried out during food hygiene inspections.*
- *Generally, work procedures had not been subject to review and did not consistently reflect current working practices*

10. Annex 2 deals with the findings of the Audit in respect of the Management of Interventions at New Food Businesses. Non-compliances with the statutory Food Law Code of Practice and/or Practice Guidance noted in this Annex included:

- *A significant proportion of new premises had not been inspected within the target of 28 days from date of opening.*
- *Although qualitative internal monitoring was being carried out, it was not in accordance with the documented procedure.*
- *None of the registration forms checked had been date stamped on receipt contrary to the requirements of the Food Law Code of Practice*
- *There had been delay of eight months in inspecting a new business which was subsequently assessed as category A (high risk) and served food to vulnerable groups.*
- *In three cases insufficient information had been recorded to demonstrate that a full assessment had been carried out in relation to HACCP or that cross contamination controls had been fully considered.*
- *In two cases insufficient information had been recorded to demonstrate that an assessment of food handler training had been carried out.*

- *On the basis of the evidence available three food establishments had been incorrectly risk rated.*
- *In two out of three cases where significant issues had been identified, these had not been highlighted for the benefit of the next inspecting officer. In one case significant issues had been highlighted.*
- *In three cases, on the basis of contraventions identified, revisits were required. The intention to revisit had not been indicated on the report of the visit provided to food business operators and no revisits had been carried out.*

11. The final issue raised by the Auditors is worthy of inclusion here in full:

“The nature of the Authority’s advisory visits to unrated food establishments prior to undertaking food hygiene risk rating inspections was discussed. One issue of particular concern was that significant contraventions had been identified during advisory visits which had not been followed up in a timely manner. Officers explained that the rationale behind the approach was to ensure food businesses were provided with detailed advice before being assessed under the Food Hygiene Rating Scheme.

This approach compromises the Authority’s ability to complete official controls at new businesses within 28 days of registration or from when it becomes aware that the establishment is operating. The Authority’s attention is brought to statutory guidance issued in relation to the Food Hygiene Rating (Wales) Act 2013.”

12. The issues noted by the Auditors relate to out-of-date or incomplete or incorrect procedures or to inadequate monitoring or, in the last example quoted above, to policy being developed in contradiction to the statutory guidance. In many cases the procedures have not been updated since 2008 and therefore do not incorporate the recommendations made by Professor Pennington in 2009. The practice relating to advisory visits being carried out to new businesses which had commenced trading which was identified by the Auditors appears to have no basis in any documented Procedure Note and is totally contrary to the statutory Food Law Code of Practice.

The Action Plan

13. An Action Plan to address the failings identified in the Audit Report has been prepared and submitted to the FSA on 9th May 2014. The Action Plan itemizes 13 areas where improvements are planned to address the recommendations. There are several common threads running through the improvements planned:

- Fundamental review of format and content of Procedure Notes and Forms
- Review of internal monitoring procedures
- Review adequacy of training and provide refresher training.
- Ensure that all training records and details of qualifications are retained
- Review of resources required to deliver Food Safety Service

14. A number of improvements have already been implemented and work is ongoing to deliver all the improvements by the target dates.

Appendix: Contextual Information

1. Number and types of Food Businesses in Gwynedd

The Food Hygiene service is responsible for the enforcement of Food Hygiene law in 2,121 food businesses registered in Gwynedd (all data as at 1st April 2014). The numbers by category are as follows:

Producer	27
Slaughterhouse	2
Manufacturer/Processor	58
Packer	8
Distributor/Transporter of foodstuffs	17
Supermarket/Hypermarket	61
Smaller Retailer	345
Other Retailer	53
Restaurant/Cafe/Canteen	452
Hotel/Guest House	286
Pub/Club	199
Take-away	140
Caring Establishment	185
School/College	137
Mobile Food Unit	28
Other Restaurant/Caterer	67
Manufacturers and Suppliers of Materials and Articles in contact with food.	4
Food Manufacturer selling by Retail	52
Total	2121

2. Risk Rating of Businesses

These premises are assessed for the overall risk that they pose to public health based upon the potential hazard (i.e. the type of food and method of handling, the method of processing, the potential number of consumers at risk), the level of compliance found when last inspected and the confidence in the ability of the management of the food business, and in the effectiveness of control procedures in place, to control the hazards.

The breakdown of the premises by risk category is as follows:

Category	
A	6
B	58
C	902
D	438
E	699

Outside Risk Rating Scheme	6
New business awaiting rating	12
Total	2121

Where Category A is the Highest Risk and Category E is the lowest risk.

3. Determination of frequency of interventions

The Risk Category of a business determines the intervention frequency, i.e. the interval between inspections. The intervention frequencies are:

Category	Frequency
A	At least every six months
B	At least every 12 months
C	At least every 18 months
D	At least every 24 months
E	Every 36 months

Categories A, B and C are regarded as 'High Risk premises' and the inspection of these premises is given priority. In 2014/15, a total of 673 inspections of High Risk premises are due. Additionally, 167 Category D premises are due for inspection. Category E premises do not have to be inspected but must be addressed by means of 'alternative enforcement strategies'. It is expected that 200 food businesses will either close or change ownership during 2014/15.

4. Seasonal Business

Of the 2121 food businesses registered in Gwynedd, 355 operate for only part of the year. This year, 154 premises which are due for inspection are only trading during the summer period and therefore have to be inspected before the end of Quarter 2.

5. New Businesses

In addition to inspecting existing food businesses, any new food businesses which commence trading must be inspected within 28 days of opening. It is expected that approximately 200 new businesses ('new businesses' includes existing businesses where there is a change of ownership) will open during 2014/15.

6. Food Hygiene Rating System

Under the now mandatory Food Hygiene Rating Scheme, most food businesses are required to display a notice on their premises which informs the public regarding the standard of Food Hygiene which has been achieved. These ratings are based upon the assessment of the inspection of the premises carried out by Food Hygiene Inspectors.

The ratings achieved by food businesses in Gwynedd are (as at 9/4/2014)

	Very good	Good	Generally satisfactory	Improvement required	Major improvement required	Urgent improvement required
FHRS rating	5	4	3	2	1	0
Restaurant/ Cafe/ Canteen	275	92	36	4	3	
Hotel/ Guest House	180	46	16	2	1	1
Small Retailer	122	38	14	6	3	
Supermarket/ Hypermarket	34	17	3	1		
Caring Premises	98	11	2	1	1	
Restaurants and Caterers - Other	47	7				
Distributors/ Transporters	2					
Pub/ Club	96	39	9	3	2	
Retailer - Other	13	2				
Take-Away	90	28	16	2	2	
School/ College	114	18	2			
Mobile Food Unit	20	3	1	1		
Manufacturers and Packers	49	12	3	3	1	
Importers/ Exporters						
Primary Producers	4	1				
Total	1144	314	102	23	13	1

Where Low Scores are given to food businesses, it is as a result of poor hygiene practice and procedures having been found during the inspection. Such businesses are targeted and monitored for improvements by officers and enforcement action may also be taken where appropriate. Businesses are now able to request a rescore inspection when they have rectified the defects found.

7. Staffing and Resources

The Food Hygiene service is part of the Public Protection Service, which operates from the three Area Offices. Although staff are based in the individual Area Offices, in fact they operate across the whole of Gwynedd as required by the pattern of workload. Many of the officers also work from home to reduce the cost of, and amount of time expended on, travelling.

In addition to undertaking Food Hygiene inspections, 12 field officers also undertake other duties such as Food Standards, Infectious diseases, Public Health and Water Safety, so the actual amount of time allocated to Food Hygiene duties is 8 FTE officers. Officers who carry out food hygiene inspections must be either a fully qualified Environmental Health Officer or hold a relevant qualification in Food Hygiene inspection. On average, officers are each expected to inspect about 100 businesses during the course of a year.

In addition, the Food Hygiene Manager expends 80% of her time on Food Hygiene matters (0.64 FTE) and there is another 1.13 FTE in Operational, Sampling and Senior Management support.

Total net expenditure on Food Hygiene service in Gwynedd in 2013/14 was £509,503.

NAME OF SCRUTINY COMMITTEE	COMMUNITIES
DATE OF MEETING	4 July, 2014
TITLE	Bus services in the Arfon area
AUTHOR	Cllr W. Gareth Roberts, Cabinet Member for the Environment and Aled Davies, Head of Regulatory Department
CABINET MEMBER	Cllr W. Gareth Roberts
PURPOSE	To raise the awareness of Committee members of the impact of the decision of Padarn Bus Ltd to cease trading and providing transport services in Gwynedd.

Background

1. The purpose of this report is to outline the impact of the decision of Padarn Bus Ltd to cease trading and providing transport services at midnight on Friday 30 May 2014.
2. A substantial financial impact on the Council derives from the changes. This report explains the steps that were taken to ensure that services continued and how the Regulatory Department, through the Integrated Transport Unit, will endeavour to manage the funding over the next few months.

Issues before 30 May 2014

3. Having received initial information regarding the company's vulnerable position, the Council's main priority under the circumstances was to protect services for users. To this end, Council officers collaborated closely with Government officers to find a solution.
4. This collaboration with the Government, on an officer and political level, continues.

Issues after 30 May 2014

5. During May, the Transportation Service arranged to tender all education and public services that were being operated by Padarn Bus and made arrangements to be commenced on Saturday, 31 May (public) and Monday, 2 June (education). Every education statutory journey has been addressed as part of this exercise, but there are some changes in the level of public transport service as outlined in Table 1.

Financial impact of the changes:

6. As a result of the changes the financial impact is substantial and a summary of these can be seen below:

Pure Education Additional Costs:

	Annual Costs	Pro Rata Costs (June until end of July 2014)
Padarn Current Costs:	£212,422.40	£35,403.73
Costs following re-tendering:	£256,998.37	£42,833.06
Difference:	£44,575.97	£7,429.33

Contracts under tender	Annually	Pro Rata (June - October 2014)
Padarn Current Costs:	£276,500.00	£115,208.33
Costs following re-tendering:	£246,425.60	£102,677.33
Difference:	-£30,074.40	-£12,531.00

S4 Contracts and Sherpa

	Annually	Pro Rata (June - October 2014)
Padarn Current Costs:	£88,639.37	£36,933.07
Costs following re-tendering:	£233,901.97	£97,459.15
Difference:	£145,262.60	£60,526.08

Commercial Contracts	Annually	Pro Rata (June - October 2014)
Padarn Current Costs:	-	-
Costs following re-tendering:	£260,955.78	£108,731.58
Difference:	£260,955.78	£108,731.58

Total:	£376,143.98	£156,726.66
---------------	--------------------	--------------------

What is the current situation?

7. Tenders issued at short notice tend to be less cost effective than the usual five year tenders but due to the circumstances and timescale there was no other option in terms of addressing the problem of maintaining services. In order to respond to this, during the summer holidays this year the Transportation Service intends to re-tender all education services that were provided by Padarn Bus which will be operational from the start of the new academic year on 2 September 2014. These will be opportunities to offer more long-term contracts in the hope of receiving more competitive prices that will reduce costs to the taxpayer.

8. An extensive and open discussion is required with partners of the Snowdonia Green Key, i.e. the Snowdonia National Park and Conwy Council in order to determine what can be done with the Sherpa bus service. Certainly, the vision is to have a quality service which is cost effective to the partnership and sustainable in the long-term. Although short-term decisions have been made to maintain the services, there is a need to fundamentally re-examine what is provided by the end of the summer. Initial contact has been made in order to hold the discussion on shaping this important service for the future.
9. Services that were operational through contracts appear to be quite cost effective from the re-tendering that was undertaken and the service will monitor these services' level of use prior to determining whether or not to tender again. Again, it is likely that this will take place later in the summer in order to provide an opportunity to gather sufficient and robust evidence as context to move forward.
10. The commercial services that Padarn provided are very costly to be maintained from the public purse. These have been put in place because of the impact their disappearance could have on people's ability to reach services, employment and education. It is hoped that companies will register them commercially during the next few weeks and costs to the Council will reduce as a result.
11. There will certainly be further changes during the next month or two, with a possibility that another company will buy the Padarn depot in Llanberis. This could lead to new opportunities in terms of providing services in north Arfon.
12. As the situation becomes more stable over the next few months, there will be an opportunity to consider a review of the arrangements of the Integrated Transport Unit by the Edge company which has recently been commissioned. As the Scrutiny Committee is aware, the financial situation in terms of providing transport was critical before Padarn's problems became evident and their impact is that the risks of seeing the financial gap increasing are substantial. Work is ongoing to try and rationalise and adapt the network within the available budget and the Cabinet will consider these proposals in the Autumn in terms of addressing how the service can deal with this situation together with the financial gap that already faced us before the crisis.
13. I believe that it is appropriate for me to note that this situation has had a substantial impact on the broader work programmes of the Regulatory Department and the Transportation Service in particular. Every effort is being made to move resources and capacity to reduce impacts on schemes and residents but it cannot be guaranteed that some delivery timescales will need to be slipped. I am having weekly discussions with the Head of Department regarding this.
14. Finally, but very importantly, I would like to emphasise my thanks to the staff of the Transportation Service, and to the staff of the Integrated Transport Unit in particular, for the commendable work that has been done to try and reduce

the impact on Gwynedd residents. I would also like to thank the staff of other departments, particularly the Finance and Legal Departments that have supported them. The impact of such an incident is substantial but through their efforts it was managed to minimise the impact on Gwynedd residents. I would like the Committee to note my appreciation of their efforts.

TABLE 1

Contract	Route	New operator	Previous frequency	Current frequency
6	<i>Bethesda - Mynydd Llandygai - Bangor</i>	Arriva	>every two hours	>every two hours
67s	<i>Bangor - Tregarth - Bethesda - Gerlan (Sundays)</i>	Arriva	every hour (and >every 2 hours by Arriva)	>every two hours
72	<i>Bangor - Felinheli - Bethel</i>	Express Motors	4 circular journeys a day (and service 73)	4 circular journeys a day - service 73 coming to an end
83	<i>Caernarfon - Deiniolen - Dinorwig</i>	Express Motors	every hour – ending at 2220	every hour – ending at 1900
85s	<i>Bangor - Deiniolen - Llanberis (Sundays)</i>	Arriva	every two hours	every two hours
88s	<i>Llanberis - Llanrug - Caernarfon (Sundays)</i>	Express Motors	every hour	every hour – but with additional journeys
87/S4	<i>Caernarfon - Waunfawr - Beddgelert</i>	Express Motors	every 2 hours – One two-way journey on Sundays	every two hours – loss of service on Sunday
Sherpa	<i>Sherpa</i>	GHA	Llanberis to Betws y Coed – every hour Llanberis to Penypass - every ½ hour Bethesda to Betws y Coed – one a day	every two hours every ½ hour on weekends only None – starts in Capel Curig
75	<i>Maesgeirchen - Bangor - Parc Menai</i>	Arriva	every hour	Removed – service 78 Arriva running every ½ hour
85	<i>Llanberis - Llanrug - Bethel - Bangor</i>	Express Motors	every hour	4 two-way journeys and education statutory journeys
88/89	<i>Llanberis - Llanrug - Caernarfon</i>	Express Motors	every ½ hours	every hour
10	<i>Caernarfon - Bangor</i>	-	every ½ hour	Council has not tendered the service – Arriva Service 5/X5 every 15 minutes
76/77	<i>Gerlan - Bethesda - Rachub - Bangor</i>	-	>every two hours	Council has not tendered the service – Arriva Service 7/67 every 20 minutes
71/75	<i>Bangor - Maesgeirchen</i>	-	every 20 minutes	Council has not tendered the service – Arriva Service 78 every ½ hour
73	<i>Bangor - Minffordd - Caerhun</i>	-	5 circular journeys a day	Council has not tendered the service – Arriva Service 72 four times a day
92	<i>Caernarfon - Maes Barcer</i>	-	Every 15 minutes and 5 minutes between Express and Padarn	Council has not tendered the service – Express Service 92 every 20 minutes

BLAENRAGLEN PWYLLGOR CRAFFU CYMUNEDAU 2014/2015

COMMUNITIES SCRUTINY COMMITTEE FORWARD WORK PROGRAMME 2014/15

4 Gorffennaf 2014	4 July 2014
<p>1. Hylendid Bwyd (Perfformiad) Cadernid y gwasanaeth a ddarperir gan y Cyngor mewn maes allweddol o ran iechyd cyhoeddus ac o ran hyfywdra yr economi leol.</p>	<p>1. Food Hygiene (Performance) The robustness of the service provided by the Council in a key field of ensuring public health and the viability of the economy.</p>
<p>2. Diweddariad Gwasanaethau Bws yn Ardal Arfon</p>	<p>2. Update Bus Services in Arfon Area</p>

30 Medi 2014 (Pwyllgor Trosedd ac Anhrefn)	30 September 2014 (Crime and Disorder Committee)
<p>1. Partneriaeth Diogelwch Cymunedol Adroddiad ar waith y bartneriaeth</p>	<p>1. Community Safety Partnership Report on the work of the partnership</p>
<p>2. Cartrefi Cymunedol Gwynedd Adroddiad Blynyddol</p>	<p>2. Cartrefi Cymunedol Gwynedd Annual Report</p>
<p>3 Ymchwiliad Craffu Balchder Bangor Adroddiad Cynnydd gan yr Aelod Cabinet</p>	<p>3. Bangor Pride Scrutiny Investigation Progress Report by the Cabinet Member</p>
<p>4. Parcio Adroddiad terfynol yr adolygiad parcio</p>	<p>4. Parking Fees Final report on the parking review</p>
<p>5. Cynllun Gwarchod Arfordir Gwynedd</p>	<p>5. Gwynedd Coastline Protection Plan</p>

02 Rhagfyr 2014	02 December 2014
1. Siarter Iaith Gymraeg Ysgolion Cynradd Gwynedd Adroddiad ar waith y bartneriaeth	1. Gwynedd Primary Schools' Welsh Language Charter Report on the work of the partnership
2. Monitro Gorfodaeth Meysydd Carafanau Adroddiad ar drefniadau monitro meysydd carafanau	2. Monitoring Enforcement of Caravan Parks Report on the monitoring arrangements of caravan parks
3. Trafnidiaeth Adroddiad Drafft Ymchwiliad Craffu Cludiant Addysg Ôl-16 Adroddiad ar y Gweithgor Aelodau - Matrics Cludiant Cyhoeddus	3. Transport Draft Report on Post-16 Education Transport Scrutiny Investigation Report on the Members Working Group – Public Transport Matrix

24 Chwefror 2015	24 February 2014
1. Gwastraff Gweddilliol Adroddiad ar ddysgu gwersi o'r casgliadau sbwriel pob 3 wythnos yn Nwyfor	1. Residual Waste Report on lessons learnt from collecting rubbish every 3 weeks in Dwyfor
2. Cadw'r Budd yn Lleol Craffu'r adolygiad – prosiect strategol	2. Retaining Economic Growth Locally Scrutinize the review – strategic project
3. Canolfannau Hamdden Diweddariad ar Adolygiad Hamdden gan <i>Just Solutions</i> Adroddiad ar broffil defnyddwyr y Canolfannau Hamdden gan ddefnyddio MOSAIC	3. Leisure Centres Update on the Leisure Review by Just Solutions Report on profile of Leisure Centre service users by using MOSAIC

Eitemau Ychwanegol	Additional Items
1. Cymunedau Cryf (Perfformiad / Cynllun Strategol)	1. Strong Communities (Performance / Strategic Plan)
2. Digartrefedd Ymchwiliad Craffu posib	2. Homelessness Possible Scrutiny Investigation
3. Strategaeth Lletya Pobl Hŷn (Perfformiad)	3. Older People Accommodation Strategy (Performance)